



October 7, 2020

Mr. Matthew Holzapfel, P.E.
Director of Public Works/Public Works Administration
City of Mesquite
1515 N. Galloway Ave.
Mesquite, Texas 75149

**Re: Kaufman County Large Diameter Transmission Water Main Project
City Contract No. 2012-012**

Dear Mr. Holzapfel,

The City of Mesquite received bids on September 24, 2020 for the Kaufman County Large Diameter Transmission Water Main project necessary to provide water service to the easternmost limits of the City. Six bids were received with the total bids, including additive alternates, ranging from \$9,366,553.75 to \$10,972,644.53. The final engineer’s opinion of probable construction cost was \$12,120,000. The detailed bid tabulation performed by the City is attached as a reference. Below is a summary of the results.

Contractor	Base Bid	Add. Alt. 1	Add. Alt. 2	Add. Alt. 3	Total
<i>Excel Aircraft, LLC</i>	\$6,114,337.50	\$174,237.50	\$285,000.00	\$2,792,978.75	\$ 9,366,553.75
<i>SJ Louis Const</i>	\$7,085,850.00	\$174,895.00	\$230,000.00	\$2,703,089.35	\$10,192,834.35
<i>Belt Construction</i>	\$6,581,860.00	\$355,050.00	\$392,450.00	\$2,947,862.00	\$10,239,622.00
<i>Ark Contracting</i>	\$7,273,945.00	\$447,100.00	\$180,000.00	\$2,572,795.00	\$10,403,840.00
<i>Mountain Cascade</i>	\$6,943,090.00	\$251,165.00	\$780,043.00	\$2,560,075.00	\$10,509,543.00
<i>Wilson Contracting</i>	\$7,606,387.22	\$282,856.50	\$342,164.67	\$2,749,736.14	\$10,973,644.53

For this project, the base bid consists of construction of Lines A and B in the contract documents. Line A consists of approximately 14,000 LF of 30-inch DR-11 HDPE water main and associated appurtenances. Line B consists of approximately 850 LF of 30-inch and 36-inch C303 Bar-Wrapped Concrete Steel Cylinder water main and associated appurtenances. Additive Alternate No. 1 consists of a recycled crushed concrete access road parallel to the water main and Additive Alternate No. 2 consists of construction of a one-lane vehicular bridge crossing of the easternmost tributary to the East Fork of the Trinity River. Additive Alternate 3 includes Line C and the Heartland Interconnection. Line C is approximately 3,500 LF of 24-inch C303 Bar-Wrapped Concrete Steel Cylinder water main and associated appurtenances east of the proposed pump station. The Heartland Interconnection consists of a 24-inch ductile iron connection between the existing Heartland 24-inch water main and proposed Line C including a flow meter and electrically actuated butterfly valve.

Excel Aircraft, LLC dba Excel Trenching (Excel) is headquartered in Carthage, Texas and had the lowest bid of \$9,366,553.75. A review of their qualification's submittal was performed by Kimley-Horn. Kimley-Horn has worked with Excel on previous projects and is familiar with their work. A recent project completed contained deviations from as-designed elevations as well as minor schedule delays. Aside from these issues, their work has been satisfactory on Kimley-Horn projects. Kimley-Horn contacted multiple references to discuss Excel's performance. Many of references were favorable. However, Kimley-Horn received schedule adherence comments from multiple references and received one negative reference related to a current project in legal proceedings delaying its completion. Aside from standard City qualifications, this project contained additional qualifications to be submitted for installation of HDPE pipe in accordance with Technical Specification 33 11 15, Article 1.6. This article requires a minimum of at least five projects of 24-inch, and larger, HDPE pipe to be submitted. Excel submitted four projects which does not meet this requirement. Two of the four projects submitted do not meet the 24-inch and larger diameter requirement. In addition, three of the four projects were performed by personnel of Excel while working for their previous employer. Since Excel Trenching was formed in 2016 and has a limited business profile, Kimley-Horn obtained a LexisNexis report for Excel Aircraft, LLC. The report identifies multiple elevated business risks, including a citing of high judgement or lien counts, and a lower end of 'medium' credit score.

S.J. Louis Construction of Texas, LTD (SJL) is located in Mansfield, Texas and submitted the second lowest bid of \$10,192,834.35. Kimley-Horn reviewed SJL's qualifications submittal and found it to meet the requirements, including the additional requirements for installation of HDPE pipe. Kimley-Horn has worked with SJL on previous projects and is familiar with their work. Kimley-Horn contacted multiple references to discuss SJL's performance on projects. All comments were favorable. Kimley-Horn also obtained a LexisNexis report for S.J Louis Construction of Texas, and the report summarized SJL as a low business risk with higher than average credit score.

Per the North Central Texas Council of Government General Provisions incorporated into the bidding documents, Section 102.12 "Disqualifications of Bidders", reads, "Bidders may be disqualified and their proposal not considered for any of the following reasons, but not necessarily limited thereto:" Subsections (4) and (5) of this Section state, "bidder performing poorly on a previous or current contract" and "lack of competency, skill, judgement, financial capability, resources, integrity, reputation, reliability or responsibility to perform the work as revealed by the bid proposal, bid questionnaires, financial statement, performance history or other relevant information obtained by the OWNER". Since Excel did not meet the HDPE qualifications for this project, has a current project with an owner citing poor performance, and poses a potential business risk, Excel Aircraft LLD dba Excel Trenching is disqualified per the procurement requirements. Based upon the information above, Kimley-Horn recommends that the City award the Kaufman County Large Diameter Transmission Water Main project to S.J. Louis Construction of Texas, Ltd for a bid amount of \$10,192,834.35.

Please do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions. We appreciate the opportunity to be of continued service to the City of Mesquite.

Sincerely,

KIMLEY-HORN AND ASSOCIATES, INC.



Jenifer Tatum, P.E

Attachments:

Bid Tabulation

Copy to:

Mr. Justin Stoker, P.E, Assistant City Engineer, City of Mesquite