

TERRY MILLICAN, R.P.L.S.
VICTOR ACUY, P.E.
RICHARD A. DORMIER, P.E.
JOHN D. GATTIS, A.I.A.
MARK HILL, P.E.
DAMIR LULO, P.E.
MICHAEL K. STACEY, P.E.
LARRY J. FREEMAN, P.E.

September 2nd, 2022

Mr. Justin Stoker, P.E.
Assistant Director of Public Works
1515 North Galloway Ave, Mesquite TX 75149

Re: Recommendation of Award
Southeast Pump Station – Generator Upgrade

Dear Mr. Stoker:

Enclosed is the Bid Tabulation for the above referenced project. Three (3) contractors submitted competitive bids for the project which were opened on September 2nd, 2022. The low bid was submitted by Prater Electric, LLC of Rockwall, Texas with a base bid amount of \$1,145,000. However, they were bidding MTU generator that will require higher screening wall of 15 ft. Therefore, additive alternate (A1.2) must be added to their base bid in the amount of \$55,000 resulting in a total low bid of \$1,200,000. The other two bidders were bidding Cummins generator that will not require higher screening walls; therefore, no additive alternates were applied to their base bids.

In Special Provisions to this project (SP-5) completion time for the project was specified at 450 calendar days. This includes 58 weeks for the generator delivery that was based on the longest delivery time stipulated by listed generator manufacturers at the time of project design. However, both Prater Electric and W-Industries changed generator delivery time to 70 and 75 weeks respectively. With this change, both bidders exceeded 450 calendar days specified for the project completion. Only Gencon Group Inc. (dba Dake Construction), the second lowest bidder, submitted their bid within the original specified time for the generator delivery and project completion.

The other element is Bidder's experience (qualification) of installing large generator sizes (1,000 kw). In low bidder's qualification list, we found only one (1) installation of a generator of this size. Freeman-Millican had positive experience with Prater Electric in the past but on much smaller generator installations and projects. The second lowest bidder, Dake Construction is a general contractor that is using H&H Electric as an electrical sub for this project. We are also familiar with H&H electric which completed multiple generator projects of this size or larger, both in Medium Voltage and Low Voltage. Also, it is worth noting that Dake Construction was bidding Cummins Generator model and size identical to the generators at the other two City's water pump stations (Barnes Bridge and Hailey). Having same generator brand and size on all three sites would simplify future servicing, maintenance and spare part procurement for the City.

September 02, 2020

In the Specifications, Instructions to Bidders, Item 8, City reserved the right to "make award of bid as may be deemed to the best advantage of the City". FMI believes that taking into account bidder's completion time, qualification and the generator brand it would be in the City's best interest to award project to Gencon Group Inc. dba Dake Construction, the second lowest bidder in the amount of 1,368,000. We would also recommend, if funds are available, to award additive alternate to extended generator's comprehensive warranty for additional \$9,100 from two (2) to five (5) years.

Sincerely,

FREEMAN - MILLICAN, INC.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Damir Lulo". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Damir Lulo, P.E.

Attach: Bid Tabulation